# Classification of Brainwaves for Sleep Stages by High-Dimensional FFT Features from EEG Signals *by* Mera Delimayanti

**Submission date:** 14-Jan-2022 09:16PM (UTC+0700) **Submission ID:** 1741664317 **File name:** applsci-10-01797-v2.pdf (1.41M) **Word count:** 5658 **Character count:** 29188





**6**rticle

### **Classification of Brainwaves for Sleep Stages by High-Dimensional FFT Features from EEG Signals**

Mera Kartika Delimayanti <sup>1,2,\*</sup><sup>0</sup>, Bedy Purnama <sup>1,3</sup>, Ngoc Giang Nguyen <sup>1</sup>, Mohammad Reza Faisal <sup>4</sup>. Kunti Robiatul Mahmudah <sup>1</sup>, Fatma Indriani <sup>1</sup>, Mamoru Kubo <sup>5</sup> and Kenji Satou<sup>5</sup>

- $\mathbf{1}$ Graduate School of Natural Science and Technology, Kanazawa University, Kanazawa 9201192, Japan; bedypurnama@telkomuniversity.ac.id (B.P.); giangnn.bkace@gmail.com (N.G.N.); robiatul.mahmudah@gmail.com (K.R.M.); f\_indriani@yahoo.com (F.I.)
- $\overline{2}$ Department of Computer and Informatics Engineering, Politeknik Negeri Jakarta, Depok 16425, Indonesia
- $\mathbf{3}$ Telkom of Computing, Telkom University, Bandung 40257, Indonesia
- $\boldsymbol{\Lambda}$ Computer Science, Lambung Mangkurat University, Banjarbaru 70714, Indonesia; reza.faisal@gmail.com
- 5 Institute of Science and Engineering, Kanazawa University, Kanazawa 9201192, Japan; kubom@se.kanazawa-u.ac.jp (M.K.); ken@t.kanazawa-u.ac.jp (K.S.)
- Correspondence: mera.kartika@tik.pnj.ac.id or mera.kartikadelimayanti@gmail.com

Received: 29 November 2019; Accepted: 2 March 2020; Published: 5 March 2020



45

60Abstract: Manual classification of sleep stage is a time-consuming but necessary step in the diagnosis and treatment of sleep disorders, and its automation has been an area of active study. The previous works have shown that low dimensional fast Fourier transform (FFT) features 59 d many machine learning algorithms have **27** in applied. In this paper, we demonstrate utilization of features extracted from EEG signals via FFT to improve the performance of automated sleep stage classification through machine rearning methods. Unlike previous works using FFT, we incorporated thousands of FFT features in order to classify the sleep stages into 2-6 classes. Using the expanded version of Sleep-EDF dataset with 61 recordings, our method outperformed other state-of-the art methods. This result indicates that high dimensional FFT  $L$  atures in combination with a simple feature selection is effective for the improvement of automated sleep stage classification.

Keywords: automatic sleep stage classification; electroencephalogram; fast Fourier transform

#### 50

Sleep is one of the basic physiological needs, and an important part of life. A typical human spends one-third of his lifetime sleeping. Lack of sleep may cause health issues, influence mood, and interfere with cognitive performance [1,2]. Examination of sleep is usually  $p(4)$  rmed with the aid of polysomnography (PSG). PSG is used to examine multiple parameters that may be useful in the diagnosis of sleep disorders, or may be analyzed in pursuit of a deeper understanding of sleep itself. Hollan, Dement, and Raynal introduced the term Polysomnography in 1974. PSG is performed using an electronic device equipped to monitor multiple physiologic parameters during sleep by recording corresponding electrophysiological signals, for instance: from the brain via electroencephalogram (EEG), from the eyes via electrooculogram (EOG), from the skeletal muscles via electromyogram (EMG), and from the heart via electrocardiogram (ECG) [3]. To collect this data, recording devices are attached to the relevant locations of the body, typically including three EEG electrodes, one EMG electrode and two EOG electrodes. ECG is also a compulsory component of PSG. Additionally, the monitoring of respiratory functions may be desired in the diagnosis of respiratory disorders such as sleep apnea and

Appl. Sci. 2020, 10, 1797; doi:10.3390/app10051797

www.mdpi.com/journal/applsci



5

require the addition of other tools applied in conjunction with the EEG electrodes, most often a pulse oximeter, oral thermometer, nasal cannula, thoracic and abdominal belt, and a throat microphone [4,5].

Figure 1 represents the standard system used for measuring the EEG signal, termed as the 22-20 system, in which the minimum number of electrodes used is 21. This method regulates the physical placement and designations of electrodes on the scalp. The head is divided into proportions from important sites of the skpc so that all areas of the brain are adequately covered. The label of 10–20 indicates that the actual distances between neighboring electrodes are either 10% or 20% of the distance from the nasion (front side of the head/anteriorly) to the inion (back side of the head/posteriorly) between the ears and 23 se where electrode points are chosen. Generally, electrodes marked with even numbers are placed on the right side of the heaps and those marked with odd numbers on the left side. The electrodes ar(29) so marked with letters to represent their locations relative to the anatomical divisions of the brain: F (frontal), C (central), T (temporal), P (parietal), O (occipital), and Fp (Frontal pole). A subscript z is used to mark the midline electrodes as zero.



Figure 1. Electrodes placement of electroencephalogram (EEG) measurement [4] (reproduced with permission by Elsevier (License Number 4781771458692)).

The electric signal in the brain is determined by measuring the difference of the electric activity between the two electrodes over a period of time. As it propagates, the signal gradually decays with distance from the source. Finally, the signal has a decreased value since only one of the parallel combinations of electrodes gives precise measurement [4,6].

EEG waveforms have several kinds of rhythms. These rhythms are remarkably useful for classification annotation of sleep score as recorded by PSG. In a normal EEG, we differentiate these rhythms into five frequency bands. Table 1 lists the frequency and amplitude ranges of these bands [4,7]





Human **Step** consists of cyclic stages, and the sleep stages are essential sections of activity during sleep. Three main stages of the sleep cycle are awake, non-REM (NREM) sleep, and rapi 56 ye movement (REM) sleep. The NREM phase is also called dreamless sleep: breathing is slow and heart

rate and blood pressure are normal. NREM sleep eventually deepens and leads to REM sleep. The REM stage occurs most often while dreaming. At the time, the body goes into a temporary paralysis to prevent it from acting out these dreams. However, during REM sleep the eyes move quickly back and forth. The absence of one of these stages or the overabundance of another can lead to the diagnosis of numerous conditions ranging from sleep apnea, hypersomnia, insomnia, or sleep talking [8].

B here are two recognized standards for interpreting sleep stages based on sleep recordings: the Rechtschaffen and Kales ( $R \& K$ ) criteria and the American Academy of Sleep Medicine (AASM) criteria. The R<sub>ZE</sub>K recommendations classify sleep into seven discrete stages: wake/wakefulness, S1/drowsiness, S2/light sleep, S3/deep sleep, S4/deep or wave sleep, REM and MT/movement time [9]. The AASM criteria are a modified version of the R & K criteria. Some differences between the AASM and R & K criteria are as follows  $[9,10]$ :

 $1.$ the AASM criteria. 19

13

 $2.$ In the AASM criteria, deep sleep (N3) is a combination of the  $53$  and  $54$  stages of the R & K criteria.

35

3. Movement time (MT) is eliminated as a sleep stage in the AASM criteria.

The stages of sleep can be thought of as a cyclic alternation of non-rapid eye movement  $(1, g)$  EM) and rapid eye movement (REM) stages [11]. It has been recognized that NREM sleep consists of four distinct stag <sub>54</sub> S1, S2, S3, and S4, each with specific characteristics. In S1, the patient is drowsy but still awake. The appearance of<sub>44</sub> eep spindles, vertex sharp waves, and K complexes mark S2 sleep. Shallow sleep consists of both S1 and S2, while deep sleep consists of S3 and S4 [12].

Conventionally, technicians have interpreted and marked the sleep stages manually. As such, it is a time-intensive process as well as being expensive and dependent on human resources. Because it is time consuming, expensive, and is an enormous process, it is not suitable to hold the large EEG datasets for sleep stages annotation by the human expert  $[13]$ . As a result, it has become necessary to develop a sleep stage classification in  $\eta$  der to achieve better accuracy.

Previous attempts at automated classification of sleep stages have been based on single-channel as well as multi-channel EEG recordings and various other physiological markers. Ronzhina et al. described a single-channel EEG based scheme utilizing an artificial neural network coupled with power spectrum density analysis of EEG recordings [14]. Zhu et al. analyzed nine features from single-channel EEG recordings and applied an artificial intelligence technique referred to as a support vector machine (SVM) to perform classification [15]. High classification performance has been reported by Huang by applying short-time Fourier transform to a two-channels recording of forehead 3 EG signals and a relevance vector machine [16]. In addition, Aboalayon et al. have conducted a comprehensive review of automatic slag stage classification (AASC) systems, which includes a survey of processing techniques including pre-processing, feature extraction, feature selection, dimensionality reduction, and classification. This study evaluated AASC methods against the sleep-EDF database based on single-channel EEG recordings, and is remarkable for having selected 10 s epochs for its analysis. Their model's performance achieved the highest accuracy in comparison to previous results [17]. Braun et al. had appl 7d low dimensional FFT features on the sleep-EDF database with the usage of eight faitical features from the Pz-Oz EEG channel. The classification performance had reached with the accuracy 90.9%, 91.8%, 92.4%, 94.3%, and 97.1% for all 6- to 2-state sleep stages [18].

In this paper, we present a system of sleep stage classification based on EEG signals. Instead of using complicated processes of signal filtering and feature extraction, we utilized high-dimensional features calculated by fast Fourier transform (FFT) from single- or multi-channel EEG signals. FFT is one of the transland verified techniques capable of extracting features from EEG signals. If an EEG signal is recorded at a sampling frequency of 100 Hz, the FFT can separate the signal into features in the range of 0-100 Hz. Typically, in previous studies, a small number of FFT features corresponding to the bands shown in Table 1 were extracted and used. However, a sangging window of 30 s at 100 Hz sampling frequency allows for an extraction of at most 3000 features in the range of

0-100 Hz. In this study, we demonstrate that by incorporating high-dimensional FFT features and **o** simple feature selection by random forest algorithm into the analysis, it is possible to outperform state-of-the-art algorithms for the Sleep-EDF database. Our proposed approach consists of three main steps: brainwaves acquisition from EEG channel, feature processing, and finally, the classification evaluation by measuring the accuracy. The flowchart of our approach is shown in Figure 2.



#### 2. Materials and Methods

2.1. Experimental Data

6

The dataset is open-source, and many previous researchers have utilized this dataset in sleep scoring research [15,17-22]. Among three available versions of the dataset, we used an expanded version containing 61 recordings from 42 Caucasian male and female subjects. The subjects' ages ranged from 18 to 79 years. This dataset was organized into two sub-sets. The first subset with 39 recordings from 20 subjects was EEG data recorded in a study from 1987 to 1991. These subjects were healthy and in ambulatory condition. The second subset with 22 recordings from 22 subjects was EEG data recorded in a study in 1994 and the subjects reported slight difficulty in falling asleep but were otherwise healthy. The EEG data had been collected over 24 h of the daily lives of the subjects. A miniature telemetry system r<sub>33</sub> rded nocturnal EEG data from four subjects in a hospital [19]. The data was collected from just two channels: Fpz-Cz and Pz-Oz, at a sampling frequency of 100 Hz. The previous researchers had established that on single-channel analysis the Pz-Oz channel demonstrated improved performance over the Fpz-Cz channel. Using R & K criteria, EEG recordings of both  $\alpha$  the subsets had been annotated by an experienced sleep technician on a 30 s basis. Therefore, the duration of each epoch is established  $\frac{28}{38}$ 0 s and yielded 3000 samples. The epochs had been annotated by sleep technicians as: AWA, REM, S1, S2, S3, S4, "Movement Time" or "Unscored.  $\frac{7}{24}$  in the other hand, the annotations using AASM criteria consisted of the designations AWA, REM, N1, N2, N3, and "Unknown sleep stage." The number of samples according to R & K criteria are shown in Table 2. After removing  $\frac{1}{28}$  lovement Time" and "Unscored," total number of the samples is 127,663. The epoch duration was 30 s.



Table 2. The number of samples in Sleep-EDF dataset (R & K criteria).

As far as features analyzed, we prepared 6000 features extracted from two channels (Pz\_Oz and Fpz\_Cz). For each channel, 1000 features were extracted at a sampling frequency of 100 Hz and epoch lasted 30 s. The features were used in the experiments separately or in combination.

1

#### 2.2. Feature Extraction with Fast Fourier Transform (FFT)

The feature represents a differentiating property or an operative component identified in a section of a pattern, and a recognizable measurement. Feature extraction is a critical step in EEG signal processing. Consequently, minimizing the loss of valuable information attached to the signal is one of the goals of feature extraction. Additionally, feature extraction decreases the resources required to describe a vast set of data accurately. When carried out successfully, feature extraction can minimize the cost of information processing, reduce the complexity of data implementation, and mitigate the possible need to compress the inform  $_{20}$  tion  $[23]$ .

The extraction of informative st  $_{20}$  tical features from the EEG signal is necessary to perform sleep stage classification efficiently. In general, the EEG signal is highly complex and non-linear, so it would be better to use a non-linear model  $\left[\frac{1}{57}\right]$ . In this study, the fast Fourier transform (FFT) is utilized to extract the features of EEG signal for sleep stage classification. Hence, the values of a given time-series data as a numeric sequence data are converted into a finite set of the frequency domain. Then, to deconstruct signals into segmented EEG signal sequences, we divided them into equal time intervals call <sub>25</sub> epochs. The length of each epoch was set to every 30 s of EEG signal. Accordingly, the epochs were then processed using frequency analysis in  $w_{46}$ ch frequency spectra were generated using FFT. We used FFT to convert a signal from its original, time doman signal to a representation in the frequency domain signal  $[25]$ . Figure 3 represents in the form of time-domain signal and frequency-domain signal.



Previous studies have shagen that FFT is a promising tool for stationary signal processing, and enjoys a speed advantage over virtually all other available methods in real-time applications, and also more appropriate for sine waveforms such as in EEG signals. However, the disadvantage is that it does not have excellent spectral estimation and cannot be employed for analysis of short EEG signals [23].

#### 2.3. Feature Selection and Optimization

12

Feature extraction is an effective way of recognizing and visualizing significant data. This process shortens the time for training and application, as well as reducing demands for data calculation and storage. Some researchers combine several feature extraction techniques in order to achieve better data analysis. Consequently, application of multiple processes may often affect feature redundancy and expansion of feature dimension. Feature selection reduces the dimension of feature space and minimizes the data training and application [26]. In this study, we conducted a simple feature selection based on the importance of each feature evaluated by random forest algorithm. Mean decrease in Gini was calculated by using  $t_{14}$  random Forest package for R, then all features were sorted in the descending order of this value. For Sleep-EDF dataset, we examined the number of important features to be selected with 50 increments in between 500 and 2500, and the most appropriate feature subset were determined for each number of classes. More details about the feature selection in this study are found in [27] which describes basically the same feature selection method.

#### 2.4. Classification Evaluation

The classification step was completed with the 5- or 10-fold cross-validation. This means for each process, this step is repeated 5 or 10 times per sample. The 5- or 10-fold cross-validation comes from the cross validation technique to evaluate prediction performance from classification model. This technique splits the date of into training and test data. We trained each fold in order to have a better estimation of the true error rate of each set. The model is created by using the training data, and the test data is used for evaluating the performance of prediction. 37

Among the various classification algorithms, we adopted the multiclass support vector machine (SVM) algorithm, a supervised machine learning method, implemented in the kernlab package for R. The SVM classifier is a popular algorithm widely applied to various problems in machine learning. SVM constructs the maximum ma<sub>49</sub> in around the separating hyperplane between the classes. In this study, we utilized a Gaussian or Radial Bask Function (RBF) Kernel. One of the advantages of the SVM method is that this method is effective when the number of features is greater than the number of samples. In addition, the model is sufficient as a classification model of the EEG signal.

6 of 12

#### 3. Experimental Results

#### 3.1. Classification of Sleep-EDF Dataset

In this experiment, 2-6 classes defined by R & K criteria were selected as class labels. Features from two channels were analyzed separately or in combination. From one channel, 3000 features (i.e., 100  $Hz \times 30$  s) were extracted. For perform once evaluation, five-fold cross-validation was conducted. The results obtained using our method are compared with the results acquired using other state-of-the-art methods in. In this Table  $3$ , it can be seen that our method with 6000 features from two channels (Pz\_Oz and Fpz\_Cz) outperformed all other methods in the classification of 6 to 2 classes.





#### 3.2. Classification of Sleep-EDF Dataset Expanded (197 Recordings)

The results of applying our method against the latest, extended version of the Sleep-EDF database, show that in contrast to the first version of the database which consisted of 61 recordings (version 1), the latest version consists of 197 recordings (version 2, released in 2018). It has been studied in many recent papers (e.g., [27,28], however, because of its large size, it is rarely studied as a whole (many papers which classified it are using only a small subset of it). Therefore, it is hard to compare the performance on it under the same or similar conditions. Instead of comparing performances, in this

subsection we mainly analyzed the relationship between classification performance and the balance of classes.

Table 4 contains the result of the classification experiment using our method. "SC" and "ST" found in the recording ID. The prefixes "SC<sup>'48</sup> nd "ST" stand for "Sleep Cassette" and "Sleep Telemetry", respectively. In this experiment, ten-fold cross validation was conducted for each recording. The average, highest, and lowest accuracies were 87.84%, 96.54%, and 37.03%, respectively. Since the accuracies are greatly affected by the degree of sample distribution among the classes in each recording, a large discrepancy exists between the highest and lowest accuracies. For example, in the recording SC4201, which achieved the highest accuracy, the AWA class occupies ~73% of the recording. In contrast, the lowest accuracy was achieved by ST7151 with a more even distribution between the classes (AWA:REM:S1:S2:S3:S4 =  $104:143:78:304:142:126$ ). This is even more clearly demonstrated in Figure 4, where we show the relationship between accuracy and degree of class imbalance (represented in this experiment by the standard deviation of class sizes in a recording). There appears to be an almost linear relationship (correlation coefficient was 0.9857).



Table 4. Performance of classification for each recording in Sleep-EDF database (version 2).

Table 4. Cont.





Figure 4. Plot of accuracy and standard deviation of class sizes in each recording.

#### 4. Discussions and Conclusions 17

In order to improve the performance of sleep stage classification, previous work has mainly focused on the following points:

- More effective methods of feature extraction from the original EEG signal (e.g., wavelet transform)
- Application of filters (e.g., band-pass filter) and noise reduction algorithms
- Identification of better classifier algorithms (e.g., random forest, adaptive boosting, and convolutional neural network)
- Improvement of class imbalance by under- and/or over-sampling (e.g., SMOTE)

extracted from single- and multi-channel EEG signals in combination with simple feature selection is an effective means of improving the performance of automated sleep stage classification. In our experiment on 6- to 2-class classification against the Sleep-EDF dataset, our method outperformed other recent and advanced methods.

Additionally, we demonstrated the result of application of our method to the classification of the recording included in the latest version of Sleep-EDF database. We clearly showed that accuracy in classifying a recording is highly influenced by the degree of class imbalance.

The differences between the amounts of the majority class and the minority class if the datasets leads to an imbalanced dataset. In other words, balanced class distributions are essential in supervised 32 dard classification. One of the methods for solving this problem is by  $\frac{q_{27}}{2}$ and it aims to achieve a balanced class distribution by creating an artificial data. SMOTE (synthetic minority over-sampling technique) is an over-sampling method that is typically used to balance an imbalanced data as a part of machine learning. New instances are created as minority class instances from minority class neighbors that performed like the original instances of the minority class [29]. Related to sleep stage classification, our experimental results suggested that by combining our 19thod with under- and/or over-sampling methods like SMOTE, we may achieve better classification performance of the recordings in the latest Sleep-EDF database.

One of the disadvantages in our method is the intensive computational requirements in memory and processor. However, it also means that if the available resource of computing is rich, its performance can be further improved. In addition to the analysis of relationship between the number of features and performance, we need to conduct future work on the effectiveness of our method in other datasets. 42 53

30 10 agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Funding: This work was partially supported by JSPS KAKENHI Grant Number JP18K11525 and Kanazawa University CHOZEN project.

Acknowledgments: The first and 38 ond authors would like to gratefully acknowledge the BUDI-LN scholarship from Indonesia Endowment Fund for Education (LPDP), Ministry of Education and Culture Republic of Ind<sup>2</sup> lesia (KEMENDIKBUD), and Ministry of Research and Technology of Republic Indonesia (KEMENRISTEK). In this research, the super-computing resource was provided by Human Genome Center, the Institute of Medical Science, the University of Tokyo. Additional computation time was provided by the super computer system in Research Organization of Information and Systems (ROIS), National Institute of Genetics (NIG).

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest

#### References

- $1.$ Touchette, É.; Petit, D.; Seguin, J.R.; Boivin, M.; Tremblay, R.E.; Montplaisir, J.Y. Associations Between Sleep Duration Patterns and Behavioral/Cognitive Functioning at School Entry. Sleep 2007, 30, 1213-1219. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- $2.$ Walker, M.P.; Stickgold, R. Sleep, Memory, and Plasticity. Annu. Rev. Psychol. 2006, 57, 139-166. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

52

- 3. Álvarez-Estévez, D.; Moret-Bonillo, V. Identification of Electroencephalographic Arousals in Multichannel Sleep Recordings. IEEE Trans. Biomed. Eng. 2011, 58, 54-63. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- $4.$ Keenan, S.A. Handbook of Clinical Neurophysiology, An Overview of Polysomnography; Elsevier B.V.: Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 2005; Volume 6, Chapter 3, p. 18.
- Billiard, M.; Bae, C.; Avidan, A. Sleep Medicine; Smith, H.R., Comella, C.L., Hogl, B.L., Eds.; Cambridge 5. University Press: Cambridge, UK, 2012.
- 6. Kaniusas, E. Biomedical Signals and Sensors I; Springer: Berlin, Germany; pp. 1-26. [CrossRef]
- Aboalayon, K.A.I.; Faezipour, M. Multi-Class SVM Based on Sleep Stage Identification Using EEG Signal. 7. Proceedings of the 2014 IEEE Healthcare Innovation Conference (HIC), Piscataway, NJ, USA, 8-10 October 2014; pp. 181-184.
- 8. Thorpy, M.J. The International Classification Of Sleep Disorders: Diagnostic and Coding Manual. Rev.Ed; One Westbrook Corporate Center, Suite 920: Westchester, IL, USA, 2001.
- Rechtschaffen, A.; Kales, A. A Manual of Standardized Terminology, Techniques and Scoring System for Sleep Stages 9. of Human Subjects; National Government Publication: Los Angeles, CA, USA, 1968.
- 10. Iber, C.; Medicine, A.A.o.S. The AASM Manual for The Scoring of Sleep and Associated Events: Rules, Terminology and Technical Specifications; American Academy of Sleep Medicine: Darien, IL, USA, 2007.
- 11. Hobson, J.A. Sleep is of The Brain, by The Brain and For The Brain. Nature 2005, 437, 1254-1256. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 12. Marshall, L.; Helgadottir, H.; Molle, M.; Born, J. Boosting Slow Oscillations During Sleep Potentiates Memory. Nature 2006, 444, 610-613. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 13. Norman, R.G.; Pal, I.; Stewart, C.; Walsleben, J.A.; Rapoport, D.M. Interobserver Agreement Among Sleep Scorers From Different Centers in a Large Dataset. Sleep 2000, 23, 901-908. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 14. Ronzhina, M.; Janousek, O.; Kolarova, J.; Novakova, M.; Honzik, P.; Provaznik, I. Sleep Scoring Using Artificial Neural Networks. Sleep Med. Rev. 2012, 16, 251-263. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 15. Zhu, G.; Li, Y.; Wen, P.P. Analysis and Classification of Sleep Stages Based on Difference Visibility Graphs From A Single-Channel EEG Signal. IEEE J. Biomed. Health Inform. 2014, 18, 1813-1821. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 16. Huang, C.-S.; Lin, C.-L.; Ko, L.-W.; Liu, S.-Y.; Su, T.-P.; Lin, C.-T. Knowledge-based Identification of Sleep Stages Based on Two Forehead Electroencephalogram Channels. Front. Neurosci. 2014, 8, 263. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 17. Aboalayon, K.A.I.; Faezipour, M.; Almuhammadi, W.S.; Moslehpour, S. Sleep Stage Classification Using EEG Signal Analysis: A Comprehensive Survey and New Investigation. Entropy 2016, 18, 272. [CrossRef]
- Braun, E.T.; Silvera, T.L.T.D.; Kozakevicius, A.D.J.; Rodrigues, C.R.; Giovani, B. Sleep Stages Classification 18. Using Spectral Based Statistical Moments as Features. Revista de Informática Teórica e Aplicada 2018, 25. [CrossRef]
- 19. Hassan, A.R.; Subasi, A. A Decision Support System for Automated Identification of Sleep Stages from Single-Channel EEG Signals. Knowl.-Based Syst. 2017, 128, 115-124. [CrossRef]
- 20. Liang, S.-F.; Kuo, C.-E.; Hu, Y.-H.; Pan, Y.-H.; Wang, Y.-H. Automatic Stage Scoring of Single-Channel Sleep EEG by Using Multiscale Entropy and Autoregressive Models. IEEE Trans. Instrum. Meas. 2012, 61, 1649-1657. [CrossRef]
- 21. Nakamura, T.; Adjei, T.; Alqurashi, Y.; Looney, D.; Morrell, M.J.; Mandic, D.P. Complexity science for sleep stage classification from EEG. In Proceedings of the International Joint Conference on Neural Networks, Anchorage, AK, USA, 14-19 May 2017.
- 22. Yildirim, O.; Baloglu, U.B.; Acharya, U.R. A Deep Learning Model for Automated Sleep Stages Classification Using PSG Signals. Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health 2019, 16, 599. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 23. Al-Fahoum, A.S.; Al-Fraihat, A.A. Methods of EEG Signal Features Extraction Using Linear Analysis in Frequency and Time-Frequency Domains. ISRN Neurosci. 2014, 2014, 730218. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Freeman, W.J.; Skarda, C.A. Spatial EEG patterns, non-linear dynamics and perception: the neo-Sherringtonian 24. view. Brain Res. 1985, 357, 147-175. [CrossRef]
- 25. Nussbaumer, H.J. Fast Fourier Transform and Convolution Algorithms; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 1981. [CrossRef]
- 26. Wen, T.; Zhang, Z. Effective and Extensible Feature Extraction Method Using Genetic Algorithm-based Frequency-Domain Feature Search for Epileptic EEG Multiclassification. Medicine (Baltimore) 2017, 96, e6879. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

- 27. Huang, W.; Guo, B.; Shen, Y.; Tang, X.; Zhang, T.; Li, D.; Jiang, Z. Sleep staging algorithm based on multichannel data adding and multifeature screening. Comput Methods Programs Biomed. 2019, 187, 105253. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 28. Timplalexis, C.; Diamantaras, K.; Chouvarda, I. Classification of Sleep Stages for Healthy Subjects and Patients with Minor Sleep Disorders. In Proceedings of the 2019 IEEE 19th International Conference on Bioinformatics and Bioengineering (BIBE), Athens, Greece, 28-30 October 2019; pp. 344-351.
- 29. Chawla, N.V.; Bowyer, K.W.; Hall, L.O.; Kegelmeyer, W.P. SMOTE: Synthetic Minority Over-sampling Technique. J. Artif. Intel. Res. 2002, 16, 321-357. [CrossRef]



© 2020 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

### Classification of Brainwaves for Sleep Stages by High-Dimensional FFT Features from EEG Signals

### ORIGINALITY REPORT



factorisation and domain-level features" , International Journal of Functional Informatics and Personalised Medicine, 2014. Publication



3 Submitted to Unviersidad de Granada<br>
Student Paper<br>
1% Student Paper





Publication



20 M. Murugappan, S. Murugappan. "Human  $\langle 1 \rangle$ emotion recognition through short time Electroencephalogram (EEG) signals using Fast Fourier Transform (FFT)" , 2013 IEEE 9th International Colloquium on Signal Processing and its Applications, 2013 Publication

21 Meiyi Yang, Yujuan Si, Gong Zhang, Di Wang, 21 merembat 20 merembat 20 merembat 20 merembat 20 merembat 20 m<br>Mejaj Sun Wei Fan Xin Liu Tiangliang Li "A Meiqi Sun, Wei Fan, Xin Liu, Liangliang Li. "A novel method for automated congestive heart failure and coronary artery disease recognition using THC-Net" , Information Sciences, 2021 Publication

22 Submitted to European University of Lefke  $\leq 1$  % Student Paper

23 Wolfe, Jeremy, Kluender, Keith, Levi, Dennis.  $\langle 1 \rangle$ "Sensation and Perception" , Sensation and Perception, 2021

 $\frac{1}{24}$  Ahnaf Rashik Hassan, Mohammed Imamul and  $\frac{1}{8}$ Hassan Bhuiyan. "Automated identification of sleep states from EEG signals by means of ensemble empirical mode decomposition and random under sampling boosting" , Computer Methods and Programs in Biomedicine, 2017 Publication

<sup>25</sup> <1% Chen, Shih-Jui, Chia-Ju Peng, Yi-Chun Chen, Yean-Ren Hwang, Ying-Sian Lai, Shou-Zen Fan, and Kuo-Kuang Jen. "Comparison of FFT and marginal spectra of EEG using empirical mode decomposition to monitor anesthesia" , Computer Methods and Programs in Biomedicine, 2016.

Publication

- $\frac{26}{3}$  Submitted to Queensland University of  $\frac{26}{3}$   $\frac{1}{\%}$ **Technology** Student Paper
	- 27 Gustavo E. A. P. A. Batista. "A study of the  $\langle 1 \rangle$ behavior of several methods for balancing machine learning training data" , ACM SIGKDD Explorations Newsletter, 6/1/2004 Publication
	- 28 Peyman Ghasemzadeh, Hashem Kalbkhani, 21 %<br>Mahrokh G. Shavesteh "Sleen stages Mahrokh G. Shayesteh. "Sleep stages classification from EEG signal based on
		-

### Stockwell transform" , IET Signal Processing, 2019 Publication



<sup>33</sup> <1% Hojat Ghimatgar, Kamran Kazemi, Mohammad Sadegh Helfroush, Ardalan Aarabi. "An automatic single-channel EEGbased sleep stage scoring method based on

## hidden Markov Model" , Journal of Neuroscience Methods, 2019

Publication



 $\frac{41}{10}$  S. Rajalakshmi, R. Venkatesan. "Chapter 3  $<$  1  $_{\%}$ Exploring Cepstral Coefficient Based Sleep Stage Scoring Method for Single-Channel EEG Signal Using Machine Learning Technique" , Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2018 Publication



 $\frac{44}{\text{Multi-Class FFG-Based Sleen Stage}} < 1\%$ Multi-Class EEG-Based Sleep Stage Classification System" , IEEE Transactions on Neural Systems and Rehabilitation Engineering, 2018 Publication

45 Peker, Musa. "An efficient sleep scoring  $<$  1 % system based on EEG signal using complexvalued machine learning algorithms" , Neurocomputing, 2016.



### 47 "Abstracts", Journal of Sleep Research,  $\leq 1$  % 08/31/2010 Publication

- 48 Hogeon Seo, Seunghyeok Back, Seongju Lee, 21 %<br>Deokhwan Park Tae Kim Kyoobin Lee "Intra-Deokhwan Park, Tae Kim, Kyoobin Lee. "Intraand inter-epoch temporal context network (IITNet) using sub-epoch features for automatic sleep scoring on raw single-channel EEG" , Biomedical Signal Processing and Control, 2020 Publication
- $\frac{49}{49}$  Mikito Ogino, Yasue Mitsukura. "Portable  $< 1$  % Drowsiness Detection through Use of a Prefrontal Single-Channel Electroencephalogram" , Sensors, 2018 Publication
- $\frac{1}{50}$  Monika Prucnal, Adam G. Polak. "Effect of  $\frac{1}{50}$   $\frac{1}{50}$ Feature Extraction on Automatic Sleep Stage Classification by Artificial Neural Network" , Metrology and Measurement Systems, 2017 Publication
- <sup>51</sup> <1% Oliver Faust, Hajar Razaghi, Ragab Barika, Edward J Ciaccio, U Rajendra Acharya. "A review of automated sleep stage scoring

based on physiological signals for the new millennia" , Computer Methods and Programs in Biomedicine, 2019 Publication

52 Rajeev Sharma, Ram Bilas Pachori, Abhay (1%) 2/1% (1%) 11 March 2016 16 March 2016 16 March 2016 16 March 20<br>Rajeev March 2016 16 March Upadhyay. "Automatic sleep stages classification based on iterative filtering of electroencephalogram signals" , Neural Computing and Applications, 2017 Publication

53 Yong Jae Lee, Young Shin Chung, Jung-Yun < 1 % Lee, Eun Ji Nam, Sang Wun Kim, Sunghoon Kim, Young Tae Kim. "Impact of increased utilization of neoadjuvant chemotherapy on survival in patients with advanced ovarian cancer: experience from a comprehensive cancer center" , Journal of Gynecologic Oncology, 2018 Publication

54 elearning.medistra.ac.id <1 %  $\frac{1}{25}$  Waset.org  $\leq$  1 % 56 WWW.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov <1 % Internet Source waset.org Internet Source Internet Source

57 Ali Abdollahi Gharbali, Shirin Najdi, José<br>Manuel Fonseca "Investigating the Manuel Fonseca. "Investigating the

contribution of distance-based features to automatic sleep stage classification" , Computers in Biology and Medicine, 2018 Publication

58 Pan Tian, Jie Hu, Jin Qi, Xian Ye, Datian Che, 21 %<br>
Ying Ding Yinghong Peng "A hierarchical Ying Ding, Yinghong Peng. "A hierarchical classification method for automatic sleep scoring using multiscale entropy features and proportion information of sleep architecture" , Biocybernetics and Biomedical Engineering, 2017 Publication

59 Emina Alickovic, Abdulhamit Subasi.  $<$ 1 % "Ensemble SVM Method for Automatic Sleep Emina Alickovic, Abdulhamit Subasi. Stage Classification" , IEEE Transactions on Instrumentation and Measurement, 2018 Publication





Exclude quotes On

Exclude bibliography On

Exclude matches Off